

## RIWAYAT KORESPONDENSI ARTIKEL

**The nest characteristics of wreathed hornbill (*Rhyticeros undulatus*) in Mount Unggaran,  
Central Java, Indonesia**

**Margareta Rahayuningsih\*, Nugroho Edi, Amin r**

Tabel Riwayat Korenpondensi Artikel

No	Tanggal	Keterangan
1	29 Agustus 2016	Review: Menambahkan checklist dan cover letter
2	01 September 2016	Paper sudah diterima kembali dan meminta waktu 2-3 hari untuk di review ulang
3	04 Juli 2017	Meninjau kembali artikel
4	10 Juli 2017	Artikel di terima

On Mon, Aug 29, 2016 at 2:53 PM, Managing Editor <[unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)> wrote:  
Dear Dr. Margareta,

Thanks for your ms submission, but pls do not forget to send us the last two pages of our template (checklist & covering letter), see here: <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/D/template.doc>

Thank you,  
Best Regards,

Ahmad Dwi Setyawan

Managing Editor,  
- Biodiversitas, Journal of Biological Diversity ([biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id](http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id)) (SCOPUS, DOAJ)  
- Nusantara Bioscience ([biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm](http://biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm)) (Web of Science (ESCI), DOAJ)

---

Chairman/Co-Chairman  
- National Seminar & International Conference on Biodiversity, <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/snmbi.html>

---

Department of Biology,  
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Sebelas Maret University,  
Jl. Ir. Sutami 36A Solo 57126, Central Java, Indonesia,  
Tel. & Fax. [+62-271-663375](tel:+62-271-663375),  
e-mail: [unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)

2016-08-29 10:50 GMT+07:00

Dear chief of editor  
Biodiversitas: Journal of Biological Diversity,  
I have revised the paper :

**The nest characteristics of wreathed hornbill (*Rhyticeros undulatus*) in Mount Unggaran, Central Java, Indonesia**

**MARGARETA RAHAYUNINGSIH\***, NUGROHO EDI, AMIN R  
Biology Department, Faculty of Mathematics and Science, Semarang State University  
\*Corresponding author: [etak\\_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id](mailto:etak_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id)

We submit article entitle “The nest characteristics of wreathed hornbill (*Rhyticeros undulatus*) in Mount Unggaran, Central Java, Indonesia” for publish in Biodiversitas: Journal of Biological

Diversity. All author agree to publish in this journal and equally contribute to this study. This paper not recognized for publication in another journal and submit for Biodiversitas: Journal of Biological Diversity only. We hope you accepted our article for publish in Biodiversitas: Journal of Biological Diversity because this study aims to found the characteristics of Wreathed Hornbill nest, especially at Ungaran Mountain.

What this study adds:

•In this study, we found that 8 nests and 6 of them are active and the rest are inactive The nest was found at 900-1200 m above sea level, trees height used as nest site was ranged between 24-35 m with diameter 0.83 - 1.75 m, nest height 11-27 m, hole diameter 33-38 cm, length of nest hole 170-211 cm, width of nest entrance 4-11 cm, length of nest entrance 14-39 cm, nest thickness 6-18 cm, temperature 20-21°C and nest shape was oval, ellipse, and irregular oval. The trees that used for nesting were Salam Klontong (*Syzygium glabratum*), Nagasari (*Syzygium antisepticum*), and Marong.

Thank you

Margareta Rahayuningsih

Biology Department, Faculty of Mathematics and Science, Semarang State University

Email: [etak\\_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id](mailto:etak_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id)

2016-09-01 6:28 GMT+07:00

Dear Chief editor.

I have revised my paper as your wish. Please kindly check the attachment. Thank you

Best Regards,

Margareta Rahayuningsih

Biology Department, Faculty of Mathematics and Science, Semarang State University

Email: [etak\\_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id](mailto:etak_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id)

De: [biodiv05@gmail.com](mailto:biodiv05@gmail.com) <[biodiv05@gmail.com](mailto:biodiv05@gmail.com)> en nombre de Managing Editor  
<[unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)>

Enviado: jueves, 6 de octubre de 2016 11:22

Asunto: Fwd: Invitation to review.

Dear Dr. Margareta R

We received again a manuscript titled: **The nest characteristics of wreathed hornbill (*Rhyticeros undulatus*) in Mount Unggaran, Central Java, Indonesia.**

We will be most grateful if you could find time to review the manuscript. The time is 2-3 weeks. Please find attached the full manuscript and Guidance for Author.

You may present your evaluations the way you deem fit. If you wish to correct parts of the manuscript itself, please indicate your corrections with a different color (for example, red for addition and blue for deletion) or use track change (for MS word program).

Thank you,  
Best Regards,

**Ahmad Dwi Setyawan**

Managing Editor,

- Biodiversitas, Journal of Biological Diversity ([biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id](http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id)) ([SCOPUS](#), DOAJ)

---

Chairman/Co-Chairman

- National Seminar & International Conference on  
Biodiversity, <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/snmbi.html>

---

Department of Biology,

Faculty of Mathematics and Natural

Sciences, Sebelas Maret University,

Jl. Ir. Sutami 36A Solo 57126, Central

Java, Indonesia, Tel. & Fax. [+62-271-](tel:+62-271-663375)

[663375](tel:+62-271-663375),

e-mail: [unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)

---

Department of Biology,  
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Sebelas Maret University,  
Jl. Ir. Sutami 36A Solo 57126, Central Java, Indonesia,  
Tel. & Fax: +62-271-863375,  
e-mail: [unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: [liangwei@hainnu.edu.cn](mailto:liangwei@hainnu.edu.cn) <[liangwei@hainnu.edu.cn](mailto:liangwei@hainnu.edu.cn)>  
Date: 2016-10-14 20:51 GMT+07:00  
Subject: Invitation to review  
To: Managing Editor <[unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)>

Dear Ahmad,

Now I have read through this MS and attached please find my comments (due to file size limit, I deleted all figures).  
It seemed to me that it provided limited data and was not so well written.

However, given that there is little data about hornbills' nests (let alone breeding ecology), I think even less information is helpful.

I just try to give a few suggestions for improving this MS.

Best,

Liang

# Re: Submission of a manuscript for publication

Kotak Masuk



Managing Editor <[unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)>

1 Sep

201

Please revised your paper, see the general comment from reviewer

6

09.22

Thank you,  
Best Regards,

Ahmad Dwi Setyawan

Managing Editor,

- Biodiversitas, Journal of Biological Diversity ([biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id](http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id)) (SCOPUS, DOAJ)

- Nusantara Bioscience ([biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm](http://biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm)) (Web of Science (ESCI), DOAJ)

Chairman/Co-Chairman

- National Seminar & International Conference on Biodiversity, <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/snmbi.html>

---

Department of Biology,  
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Sebelas Maret University,  
Jl. Ir. Sutami 36A Solo 57126, Central Java, Indonesia,  
Tel. & Fax. +62-271-663375,  
e-mail: [unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)

Dear Author,

Thanks for your submission, but pls do check again the comment from reviewer, and don't forget to send us the last two pages of our template (checklist & covering letter), see here: <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/D/template.doc>

Thank you,  
Best Regards,

Ahmad Dwi Setyawan

Managing Editor,

- Biodiversitas, Journal of Biological Diversity ([biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id](http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id)) (SCOPUS, DOAJ)
- Nusantara Bioscience ([biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm](http://biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm)) (Web of Science (ESCI), DOAJ)

---

Chairman/Co-Chairman

- National Seminar & International Conference on Biodiversity, <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/snmbi.html>

---

Department of Biology,  
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Sebelas Maret University,  
Jl. Ir. Sutami 36A Solo 57126, Central Java, Indonesia,  
Tel. & Fax. [+62-271-663375](tel:+62-271-663375),  
e-mail: [unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)

2016-09-01 6:28 GMT+07:00

Dear Chief editor.

I have revised my paper as your wish. Please kindly check the attachment. Thank you

Best Regards,

Margareta Rahayuningsih

Biology Department, Faculty of Mathematics and Science, Semarang State University

Email: [etak\\_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id](mailto:etak_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id)

On Mon, Aug 29, 2016 at 2:53 PM, Managing Editor <[unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)> wrote:  
Dear Bu Etha,

Thanks for your ms submission, but pls do not forget to send us the last two pages of our template (checklist & covering letter), see here: <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/D/template.doc>

Thank you,  
Best Regards,

Ahmad Dwi Setyawan

Managing Editor,

- Biodiversitas, Journal of Biological Diversity ([biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id](http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id)) (SCOPUS, DOAJ)
- Nusantara Bioscience ([biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm](http://biosains.mipa.uns.ac.id/nusbioscience.htm)) (Web of Science (ESCI), DOAJ)

---

Chairman/Co-Chairman  
- National Seminar & International Conference on  
Biodiversity, <http://biodiversitas.mipa.uns.ac.id/snmbi.html>

---

Department of Biology,  
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Sebelas Maret University,  
Jl. Ir. Sutami 36A Solo 57126, Central Java, Indonesia,  
Tel. & Fax. [+62-271-663375](tel:+62-271-663375),  
e-mail: [unsjournals@gmail.com](mailto:unsjournals@gmail.com)

*Margareta Rahayuningsih <etak\_sigid@mail.unnes.ac.id>*  
*2017*

*4 Jul*

*06.46*

*kepada Managing*

Revised my manuscript for biodiversity

Sincerely yours,

**Dr. Margareta Rahayuningsih, M.Si**

**Biology Department Faculty of Mathematics and Science**  
**Universitas Negeri Semarang**  
Gedung D11 (Laboratorium Biologi)  
Kampus Sekaran, Gunungpati, Semarang, Jawa Tengah 50229  
Office Phone/Fax : +62 24 850 8033  
Mobile Phone : +628122836272



## *General Comment for Author :*

I believe that the manuscript may be of interest to the journal and this sheds light on the nest characteristics of wreathed hornbill. However, this is not a new issue and has already been previously studied, for example by:

- Poonswad, P. (1995). Nest site characteristics of four sympatric species of hornbills in Khao Yai National Park, Thailand. *Ibis*, 137(2), 183-191.

-Datta, A., & Rawat, G. S. (2004). Nest-site selection and nesting success of three hornbill species in Arunachal Pradesh, north-east India: Great Hornbill *Buceros bicornis*, Wreathed Hornbill *Aceros undulatus* and Oriental Pied Hornbill *Anthracoceros albirostris*. *Bird Conservation International*, 14(S1), S39-S52.

Moreover, the number of nest found by authors is very low (only 6 were actives). Some sections of materials and methods need to be better described, to understand as have been performed, and be able to be repeated by other researchers. Therefore, the article needs a thorough review.

Finally the results are purely descriptive; you should apply some statistical analysis.

**Abstract:** The abstract needs to improve English writing.

Line 6: "one of them **was** Wreathed Hornbill" or "one of them **is** Wreathed Hornbill"

Line 8: Rewrite this sentence: "Large trees as nested place in dangerous due to illegal logging".

Line 8: "to found" or better "to study or to known".

Line 10: The specific name of the study sites is not necessary in the summary section. However, this information is important in the materials and methods section.

Line 12, 13, 14: This sentence is too long, please try to split in some

sections. Keywords: Do not repeat the same words used in the title

**Introduction:** Although I believe that this information is important (legislation), I do not think you should start the manuscript with this information. I think the goal of the study should be defined at the end of the introduction section. Please try to define the problems of this bird in a single paragraph without repeating several times factors (e.g. illegal hunting )

Line 21: Change this sentence by "Hornbills were protected under the government"... Line 24: Why it mentioned before Appendix 2 to Appendix 1? Line 26-33: Try combining these two paragraphs: paragraphs with 3 or 4 lines should be avoided.

I think the goal of the study should be defined at the end of the introduction section

## *Materials and methods*

**Study area.** The study area needs to be developed, indicating some climatic characteristics, better description of the study area, vegetation...

Line 45. Why the dates are different in both years? One from May to November and another from August to November.

Line 50. Change “around” by “between”

**Data analysis.** There is no data analysis section?

### *Results and discussion.*

Line 56. Change “was” by “were”. Please check the English. Line

57. while 1 (one) nest. Put 1 or one (better) but not both. Line

58 and 59. can or could be?

Line 61. the trees that were used as nest were:

Line 62. corrects MMMarong.

Line 62. “are the families of Myrtaceae”... change by “belong to the families of Myrtaceae”....

Line 63. was ranged or ranged

Line 63-64. Put the verbs is past tense: e.g had

Line 65-66. The results show that the height and diameter of the tree as nest habitat was according to the body size... What results? Please perform at least a correlation analysis. Try to check this phrase: The observations indicate that Wreathed Hornbill selected trees with more than 20 meters of height and diameter about 1 meter.

Line 70. what values?

Line 71-79. This paragraph is a bit confusing, what is the goal? Line

82-86. This information is redundant with Table 2 and 3. Line 90.

Change “was” by “were”. Please check the English.

Line 110-115.

This information should appear in the results section and not the end of the manuscript. In addition it is redundant with information provided before.

### *References*

Put the names of journals always the same (abbreviated or not, but not both). For example (Indonesian Scientific Journal) or (Bird Conserv Intern).

Figures should be numbered according to their appearance in the text

**Figure 1.** This figure was copied from the article: Poonswad, P. (1995). Nest site characteristics of four sympatric species of hornbills in Khao Yai National Park, Thailand. *Ibis*, 137(2), 183-191. Please change this figure and / or cite this work.

**Figure 2.** Please refer to this figure in the Materials and methods section. Only 7 nests are shown, but you mentioned that were 8 (line 11).

**Figure 4.** Nest 7?? What the meaning, not clear Table 1.

how these variables are measured?

