

Middle-low Income and Nationalism View from Street Vendors as Informal Workers

by Eko Handoyo

Submission date: 01-Dec-2020 08:51AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1460883181

File name: nd_Nationalism_View_from_Street_Vendors_as_Informal_Workers.docx (181.15K)

Word count: 10064

Character count: 55276

THE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES & SOCIAL STUDIES

Middle-low Income and Nationalism: View from Street Vendors as Informal Workers

Eko Handoyo

Lecturer, Department of Political and Civic, Faculty of Social Sciences, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Retnoningrum Hidayah

Lecturer, Department of Accounting, Faculty of Economic, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Abstract:

Currently the formal sectors are not able to accommodate the workers; for them the informal sector exists as a safety valve for the employment in common unstable Indonesian economic. One of the most famous informal sectors in Indonesia is street vendors. Street vendors is the informal sector which plays accommodate formal sector workers who experienced lay-offs or who was thrown from the formal sector. This paper aims to capture how the city of Semarang government policy in regulating and organizing street vendors. In the article, analyzed whether the policy of Semarang city government more pro- neoliberalism or reflect nationalism, which has a marginal bias to community groups. This research based on in-depth interview by state government and the people who work in street vendors. It is focus in how the workers construct the nationalism based on their participation in developing the city, especially in this research, Semarang City-Indonesia.

Keywords: Neoliberalism, nationalism, partisanship, policy, street vendors

1. Introduction

Since the economic crisis hit Indonesia in 1997, the informal sector became choice for marginalized groups to seek sustenance to meet the needs of family life. Informal sector became the last choice for uneducated and unskilled urban residents and rural labor who are not absorbed in the formal sector (Bhowmik 2005; Noer Effendi 2005).

The uneducated and unskilled urban were forced into the informal sector, as reported by Sethuraman and Davis in his research in Ghana. According to Sethuraman (1976), the urban who do not have adequate skills go into the informal sector due to the inability of the formal sector to absorb them. Similarly, Davis (2008) mentions that street vendors are an integral part of the informal economic sector. Informal economic sector is growing in developing countries, including Ghana, because of the planned economic development does not create sufficient jobs to reduce unemployment.

Since the implication of the policy of decentralization, the informal economy in an unfavorable position, because government policy are more aligned to investors who manage the formal economic activity (Morrell 2008). Semarang city government is one example of a local government that focuses on the interests of investors. Rapidly growing business hotel, retail, property, culinary, and entertainment centers is an indication of this. The government is busy serving the investors because the government has big goals to be achieved, that is, the city of Semarang as a center of trade and services through the SETARA program. The desires and goals can only be achieved if governments spur investment and if necessary sacrifice the interests of marginal groups, such as small traders. Physical arrangement of the last three years and the license granted to entrepreneurs to build hotels, apartments, retail, and other activities that are considered to accelerate the achievement of the program SETARA.

Whether the policies that favored the rich can be classified as neoliberal nationalism or they still have nationalism in setting policy concerning the interests of the people is what will be discussed in this study. This study aims to capture whether the policies made and implemented in Semarang city government adopt neoliberal character or nationalism. How deep is the nationalism in Semarang city government policies, particularly policies relating to economic activity run by street vendors, is the question being answered in this study. The study explains how the nationalism of Semarang city government policies is, particularly in the arrangement of street vendors.

2. Research Methods

This research based on qualitative research that makes researcher can be involved with an object to get more information about everything related to the research to build the analysis (Neumann, 2003). This research use case study, one which investigates the above to answer specific research questions and which seeks a range of different kinds of evidence, evidence which is there in the case setting, and which has to be abstracted and collated to get the best possible answers to the research questions (Gillham 2000).

This case study involves issues are explored through a case that is bound in a bounded system (Creswell 2007:73). Type of case studies in this study is a single instrumental case study, in which researchers focus on one issue or the center of attention, and then select one of the cases tied to illustrate the case. Design of the case study has been selected for three reasons. First, the street vendors who work in the Semarang City spread over all the districts, so it must be determined straightly. Second, vendors based on the location they occupy have diverse characteristics.

For this research the examples for the street vendors are Kalisari and Barito. Street vendors who sell ornamental plants Kalisari located along the road from the hospital Kalisari Kariyadi to extending north to the Tugu Muda monument and at the back there is a small river, geographically suitable occupy the area (although the actual area occupied legally not allowed because it is located on the riverbanks), but because they can keep clean, so it was allowed to sell the municipal government. Similarly, Barito street vendors (selling auto parts and motorcycle), which occupies the edge of riverbanks East Flood Canal still allowed to trade by the municipal government, for being able to maintain order and cleanliness. Barito Kalisari street vendors and street vendors were included in official as it gets legalized or at least allowed by the government.

In this case, street vendors are the unit of analysis such as PKL Sampangan, Basudewo, and Kokrosono categorized as informal or illegal street vendors, because it occupies a restricted area. PKL Sampangan, Basudewo, and Kokrosono area occupies the edge of riverbanks Kaligarang to Kali Banjir Kanal. Third, problems can be identified quite a lot of street vendors, for example, problems of work ethic, entrepreneurship, quality of life, social networking, social interaction with formal sector, power relations with the government and employers, and conflict with the local government. Government's repressive policies led to resistance among street vendors. In relation to the issue of this resistance, the street vendors who live in Sampangan, Basudewo, and Kokrosono, as appropriate, to serve as the object of research, because in the last two years (2009-2010) at the three locations of street vendors face the power of the city government who want to relocate their activities. A small portion of the group members are willing to relocate street vendors, and most of them take the fight and survive in each location.

This research will use non-probability and *purposive sampling* methods to get information (Creswell 2007; Nasution 1988). The explanation also will combine documentary review and purposive sampling interviews from varied sources. For these informants, they are identified as 'symbolic representation' of the information. They are persons who have rich information and multi perspective to explain this issue. Interviewee is also using the interview guidelines for all informants from different backgrounds. They come from these perspectives:

- Government : Semarang Mayor (Staff of local government)
- Workers : Semarang street vendors (Based on three groups of street vendors: Sampangan, Basudewo and Kokrosono)
- Semarang citizens : User or consumers of street vendors

3. Literature Review

3.1. Workers in Informal Sectors and Street Vendors

Castells and Portes (1984) defines the informal sector as the process of generating revenue (income - circulation) are governed by public institutions in the legal and social environment in which similar activities are regulated. Activities of the informal sector is a dynamic activity in which not only the economic aspects that play a role, but also a social theory, especially the exchange also contributes in understanding the activities of the informal sector. The informal sector activities have temporal or temporary nature and the growth can be switched into the formal sector.

The International Conference of Labor Statisticians (ICLS) in 1993 resulted in an agreement that is referred to the informal sector and employment in small-scale production and / or unlisted companies (Chen, et al 2005:38). In this conference, the informal sector is divided into two forms, namely informal self-employment and informal wage employment. Included in informal self-employment were employers, in their own account workers in informal enterprises, and unpaid familyworkers, while belonging to the informal wage employment are employees of informal enterprises, casual or day Labourers, temporary or part-time workers, paid domestic workers, unregistered or undeclared workers, and industrial outworkers (also called homeworkers).

Ozveren (2005) mentions six character on informal workers, namely: (1) the degree of competition is low, (2) easy to enter, (3) is determined by the market price of the product, (4) concentrate on retail goods at low prices, (5) process production relies on labor intensive, and (6) low productivity. In a survey in Brazil, Henley (2006) mentions three characters of the informal sector. First, the absence of the registered labor contract. Secondly, the absence of pension benefits. Third, micro-scale activities.

Not all informal activities can be incorporated into the informal sector. The OECD suggests three criteria of the informal sector. First, work is under a formal business unit in which the subject manages, legal protection, and recognition in the formal economy and beyond it is the work of the informal economy. Second, despite working outside the informal economic activity, but it is not categorized as informal economy if it produces goods and services illegal. This second activity in the terminology of the OECD (2005:37) referred to the non-observed economy. This is not observed in the sector of the underground economic, illegal, informal or undertaken by households for their final destination.

Underground production usually avoid legal standards, such as minimum wages, maximum working hours, safety or health standards. Illegal manufacturing produces goods and services that are sold or ownership is prohibited by law or production activity is usually legal, but became illegal when provided by individual producers who are not authorized. The informal sector represents an important part of the economy and labor market in many developing countries. Most informal sector activities provide goods and services in which the production and distribution legal. Informal sector companies usually choose to goods that are not listed and there is no

license in order to avoid regulation and reduce the cost of production (OECD 2002:39). Third, domestic activities, such as keeping or maintaining the house (home - care) can not be categorized as informal economic activity.

The number of concepts in the above informal sector, the informal sector in question in this research is the economic sector that has the character of a self-owned business, based on local resources, small-scale operations, the technology is simple and adaptive, not registered, far from the reach of the government, and the market is competitive. Hence, street vendors (PKL) is examined in this study. Why vendors? First, PKL has a fairly high mobility than other informal sector. Second, vendors are often considered problematic in relation to the city or county government. The problem arises because, on the one hand, the government wants a clean and beautiful city, so that the policy does not want street vendors move in public spaces (urban space). On the other hand, because of economic pressure and helplessness in him, the street vendors are forced to work on the streets in order to connect his life, so his attitude tends to be resistant to such efforts undertaken by the government.

Street vendors (PKL) has a unique history. The origin of street vendors, can be traced back to the Dutch colonial era. Formerly Netherlands make a rule that every road should be built to provide a means for pedestrians or pavement, the width is five feet. When Indonesia became independent, pedestrian walkways used by traders to sell, as well as storefront. Originally they were called merchant overhang, eventually dubbed vendors (Permadi 2007).

3.2. Neoliberalism versus Nasionalism

Priyono (See Winarno (2010), describe neoliberalism in two meanings. Firstly, ideology or agenda setting society based on homo economicus dominance over another dimension in man. Secondly, as a continuation of the first sense, neoliberalism is also interpreted as the dominance of the financial sector over the real sector in the political economic order. In the first sense, the external colonization occurred over a wide range of anthropological dimension in multidimensional human life, while the second refers to the notion of internal colonization based on finance above homo homo economicus multidimensionality system itself. Perspective presupposes that neoliberalism pursue the goal of individual wealth accumulation, because human life is reduced solely as a means of acquiring wealth. Activity of man as homo economicus based on aspects of profit and loss, so that the question of the common good is the only side effect alone.

In reviewing the role of the state, neoliberalism provide a view that economic life should be organized by eliminating or reducing state intervention. State intervention should be trimmed, because, according to Friedman (Friedman, 2003), only will bankrupt the country. In line with the social and political democracy (liberal) which gives more freedom of individual citizens in the political field, then the free market regime should be given maximum opportunity to govern how individual citizens can express their economic freedom.

This presupposes the separation of political and economic sphere, where political in the sense of life with state let into the affairs of state, while the economy let into the affairs of individual citizens. If the individual is allowed to transact in a market mechanism, without government interference, it will achieve the freedom of individuals to undertake economic activities that will improve the welfare of individuals. The accumulation of individual well-being will affect the welfare of society and the nation, as Adam Smith envisioned. The adherents of state neoliberalism reject active role, because it would threaten human liberty and individual autonomy (Private 2008). But in the reality, the separation caused the market becomes uncontrollable, sometimes distorted, many people have become rich through the mechanism of the free market, but for those who cannot compete, many of which are falling and poor. Instead of the rich will drive economic similarities, in reality they are getting greedy and bring socio-economic inequality. This is in line with the nature of classical liberalism or neo-liberalism in which through the free market, they are trying to find the maximum profit with the smallest sacrifice (Swasono 2010). This view is also in line with the opinion Mubyarto (2004) which states that foreign capitalists come to Indonesia to make a profit by opening a business.

In practice, neoliberal policy wanted a variety of barriers that hinder economic performance must be removed, including removing subsidies for the poor, causing many people who are not able to survive because of the low purchasing power, even feared the poor emerged recently as a result of the increase in prices of goods and services.

In the context of international relations or relations between developed countries with developing countries, neoliberalism hide the real nature of economic imperialism, in which the existence of the institution of the IMF and World Bank as provide assistance financially to improve the economic performance of developing countries and poor countries, but in practice, given the burden of enormous debt that the recipient is not able to pay off the debt. Mexico went bankrupt in 1982-1984, because the debt is too big and cannot afford. As a result, they accept the terms of aid and neoliberal agents (Harvey 2009). In exchange transaction accounts payable, corporate donor countries can move freely in the recipient country and more fundamentally, the recipient is forced to rely on state aid through the mechanism of the IMF and the World Bank. In addition, they instill interest in shares or investment developing countries, because these countries are rich in natural resources and cheap labor. Indonesia, as one of the recipient countries is rich in natural resources is a priority of the developed countries that are members of the IMF and the World Bank.

Nationalism is the spirit of worship and loyalty to the homeland, the homeland, and nation (Swasono, 2012). As a movement, nationalism is understood as a strategy to achieve and maintain independence, independence, and self-reliance. In the global era, the economy can be built state-based nationalism? Joan Robinson believed (Robinson, 1972), that economics is actually rooted in nationalism. Greenfield (Greenfield 2004) also realizes that even though today's worlds are at an advanced stage of capitalism period, but there is no doubt that nationalism does not disappear, even not show signs would soon disappear. What about the Indonesian economic nationalism? Economic nationalism in the system is built in Indonesia as the view Mubyarto (1988) with Pancasila economic system. Pancasila economic system has characteristics, including (1) economy wheel driven by economic stimuli, social, and moral, (2) there is a strong will of the whole society realize the economy weather the state of social equity, (3) policy economic

priority is economic development strong national and resilient, which means that nationalism always animates every wisdom economics. (4) cooperative is a pillar of the national economy, (5) the existence of a specific and clear balance between centralism and decentralization economic policies to ensure economic justice and social justice while maintaining the principle of efficiency and economic growth .

Discourse of economic nationalism, giving room for the state to intervene in economic life within the confines of that is understandable, in a sense still providing economic freedom of expression for citizens (including the rich or capitalist), but in some cases, the state is obligated through affirmative policies to help disadvantaged communities, such as poor fishermen, poor farmers, traders and street vendors. This is important, because they often become victims of neo-liberal policies, such as increased fuel prices. The fuel price hike is defined as the lifting of the fuel subsidy by the government that much more enjoyable for the middle to the top. The budget is used for subsidy partially diverted to compensation for communities affected by fuel price increases in the form of a BLT/Bantuan Langsung Tunai (Direct Cash Assistant) or BLSM. Based on Prasetyantoko's study (2009) showed that compensation subsidy only boost purchasing power by 0.6 percent, while the impact of the fuel subsidy removal pushed up inflation of 2.80 3.02 percent. BLT policy mercy through government -initiated or BLSM Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono is good, but it was only temporary, as it will only encourage the growth of mental beggars. The policy cannot create a society survive and independent in managing their lives.

In the realm of policy, neoliberalism emerged as the thesis of the welfare state is shown by the increasing economic marginalization of traditional community-based schemes. This concept affects traditional economic weakness, such as markets and street vendors as a grassroots economic base. The emergence of modern retail, as well as medium malls Alfamart and Indomart and Hypermart in various parts of the city is a form of government policies that are not pro-poor. Though putting the public interest is not enough, but more than that policies and public services should be provided to the poor and disadvantaged. Pro-poor policies that reflect the policy of nationalism hit by short-term goal, i.e. the material benefits of the ruling elite. Daniel Suryadarma study (2007) found that traditional market slowdown because the developing supermarket. Similarly, Reardon and Hopskin (2006) in his study conclude that there is a negative impact of the proliferation of supermarkets to traditional retailers.

The attitude to be taken as the government 's economic policy makers , not necessarily to reject the global currents that are influenced by neoliberal understanding , but more important is how the measures taken by the government has put forward the interests of the public , particularly the poor and disadvantaged , such as farmers , fishermen , market traders and street vendors (PKL). This is in line with the thinking Swasono (2012), that nationalism is not chauvinistic exclusivism that ignore global interdependence, but as ideas that prioritizes national interests without ignoring global responsibility .

4. Findings and Discussion

4.1. Evaluation on Semarang City Government Policy

A public policy in principle contains the public interest, not the interests of the state, government or political elite. As long as the public policy has a value and benefits to the public interest, it can be called public policy. In public policy there are three core values, they are (1) smart, means capable of solving real problems experienced, (2) wise, means the new-defined policies do not cause new greater problems and (3) giving hope to all people that they can have a better future (Nugroho 2009:329). Theoretically, government policies tend to be well established and ideal, but its implementation is often not in accordance with the ideals contained in the policy . Policies are associated to planning. Even a best plan will not be good if the execution or implementation is not optimal, or deviate from the plan moreover. Implementation of the policy is a continuation of politics by different means (Dye 2002). Hence, a political decision must be accomplished by a variety of actions with strategy or tactics. In a short sentence, Anderson (2000) describes the implementation of the policy as "What happens after a Bill becomes Law". It means that the implementation of policies relate to what happens after the bill becomes law.

A policy should be implemented in order to have the desired effect or purpose (Winarno 2007). According to van Meter and van Horn, quoted by Nawawi (2009), the implementation of the policy actions taken by individuals, officials, or government and private groups are directed to achieving the goals outlined in the policy decision. Implementation is also interpreted as a process or series of decisions and actions which are intended to allow the decisions adopted by the legislature can be run (Winarno 2007). The role of implementation, according to Grindle (1980) is to establish an association that facilitates policy objectives to be realized as a result of a government activity.

From a variety of opinion, it can be concluded that the activity is not simply a final activity of a policy, but it is a process or activity to ensure that policies or decisions that have been set to run properly. Implementation of the policy is not only seen from the implementation of the program, but measured from how the program can achieve the goals and objectives set by the policy. In this regard, van Meter and van Horn, as revealed again by Winarno (2007) suggested that the goals and objectives of a policy to be implemented should be identified and measured. This is important, because the implementation of the policy will not succeed if the goals set can not be measured.

The measure of policy goals and objectives can be seen in the statement of policy makers or the regulations herein specified. To find out how educational development goals can be achieved or already implemented, a policy analyst can examine the documents of the 1945 amendment to article 31 paragraph (4). The article stipulated that the state education budget prioritize at least twenty percent of budget revenues and expenditures of state and local income and expenditure budget to meet the needs of national education. If there is an area of provincial or district that has not put the education budget by 20%, it means that education policy does not run properly.

In order to understand the government's policy in protecting workers, mainly women and children, a policy analyst should review the Act No. 13 of 2003 on Manpower. The articles can be studied in between chapters 68 to 85. Article 68 for example, mandates that employers are prohibited from employing children. If there are employers to hire children, then it may be subject to sanctions for violating the provisions of labor laws. However, article 69 of this Act gives concessions to employers, that he may employ children between the ages of 13 to 15 years to do light work provided they do not interfere with the child's physical, mental and social development. Hence it can be concluded that a policy can be implemented and can be measured if the goals and objectives are clear. If not, then the policy implementation is questionable.

The most important issue in the implementation of policy is how to move a decision into an activity or operation in a certain way (Jones 1991). Implementation of a policy program is done through three pillars, namely:

- i. organization, which involves the establishment or realignment of resources, units and methods to make the program can run,
- ii. interpretation, means interpreting so that a program can be an appropriate plan and direction that can be accepted and implemented,
- iii. application, means the routine provision of services, and other payments that are tailored to the objectives of the program (Nawawi 2009).

The success of policy implementation activities depends on what is done by executing agencies. Policy implementation activities undertaken by the implementing agencies covering various types of activities, namely:

- i. implementing agencies charged by statute with the responsibility of running the program must obtain the resources necessary for the implementation went smoothly,
- ii. implementing agencies develop the language of charter to be concrete directives, regulations, plan and program design,
- iii. agencies should organize their activities by creating bureaucratic units and routines to cope with the workload,
- iv. implementing agencies providing benefits or limitations to its customers or groups of targets (Winarno 2007).

Public policy making does not end when law or regulations have been formulated by competent authorities. Implementation of policies involves all activities designed to bring the policy to the legislature to become law. These activities also create a new organization, such as departments, agencies and bureaucracies. These organizations must be able to interpret laws and legislation into operational rules and regulations.

In the framework of this function, the organization must be able to assign personnel, preparing contracts, use of funds, and perform tasks. All the activities involve decisions made by bureaucrats. In a society with increasing complex problems and needs, bureaucratic position as decision-making institutions of public interest is increasing. In practice, bureaucracies perform routine tasks and in certain circumstances it may make discretionary or take a different policy that benefit the public interest or at least not detrimental to the public.

In general, the bureaucrats have strong beliefs about the values in their program and duties (Dye 2002). The official Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) in the United States has a strong commitment to the environmental movement, the CIA officials also have strong beliefs about the importance of good intelligence for national security, and officials at the Social Security Administration (SSA) has strong commitment to maintaining the advantages of the system's resignation. Corruption Eradication Commission (KPK) of Indonesia has a strong commitment to creating Indonesia free from corruption. WALHI is very interested in the preservation of the environment in Indonesia. Similarly, Street Vendors Association of Indonesia (APKLI) is committed to empowering street vendors. In relation to the existence of street vendors in Semarang, Semarang Street Vendors Association (PPKLS) has a high commitment and concern for the fate and future of street vendors.

One element that must be considered by policy implementers (bureaucrats) is communication. Effective policy implementer must know what they should do. Policy decisions and orders shall be forwarded to the appropriate personnel, before the decision and command can be followed. In this sense, the communication is viewed to have an important role. Edwards (in Winarno 2007) proposes three important things in the policy communication process, ie transmission, clarity, and consistency

In terms of transmission, an official who will implement the decision should realize that a decision has been made and the orders have been issued. In this transmission there are obstacles that must be considered carefully by policy implementers. Constraints that include (1) the existence of disagreement between the executors with instructions issued by policy makers, (2) information through a hierarchy of multi-layered bureaucracy, (3) receipt of communication is also hampered by the perception and the unwillingness of the executive to know policy requirements (Winarno 2007).

Good policy not only requires the implementation of guidelines and technical instructions, but also determined by the presence of a clear communication policy. Often the instructions passed to the executor is very vague, not clear when to be executed and how to be implemented. Vagueness of this communication will lead to various interpretations of the policies to be followed up.

Consistency is the third factor of the communication policy. To achieve effective policy implementation, the order or instruction execution must be consistent. Inconsistent command will encourage implementers to act loosely in interpreting and implementing the policy. This erroneous interpretation would lead to ineffective implementation of the program, so the intended purpose can not be achieved.

Each policy should have the desired impact or consequences. The impact or consequences is the changes that can be measured in a broad issue, related to the program that has been established, by law or judicial decision (Winarno 2007). A good decision is supposed to produce good consequences (Parsons 2005). In reality, not all policies have a good and beneficial impact for those charged with policy. Good policy can be analyzed from the extent of the policy benefit for those charged with policy. Related to this, Dunn (in Nugroho 2009) suggests five common procedures in policy analysis that can be used to measure the success of a policy, they are:

- 1) Definition, means yielding information on the conditions that give rise to policy issues,

- 2) Prediction, means providing information about the future consequences of the implementation of policy alternatives, including if it does not do something,
- 3) Prescriptions, means providing information on alternative consequences value in the future,
- 4) Description, means providing information about current and past consequences of the implementation of policy alternatives,
- 5) Evaluation, means the usefulness of policy alternatives in solving problems.

In policy analysis, it is necessary to make problem formulation, forecasting future policy, and policy recommendations. In the later case, a policy analyst should be able to determine the best policy alternative and the reasons why the alternatives were chosen. Good policy recommendation includes six criteria, namely:

- 1) Effectiveness, with regard to whether an alternative can achieve the expected results,
- 2) Efficiency, with respect to the amount of effort required to produce the desired level of effectiveness,
- 3) Adequacy, with regard to how far a level of effectiveness satisfies the needs, values or opportunities that cause problems,
- 4) Alignment, regarding the equitable distribution of policy benefits,
- 5) Responsiveness, with regard to how far a policy can satisfy the needs, preferences, or the value of community groups which become the target of policies,
- 6) Eligibility, regarding the question whether the policy is appropriate for a society.

Anyone realize that the consequences of policy action is never fully known, and therefore monitoring of policies is a must (Dunn 2003). Policy recommendations can be viewed as a hypothesis about the relationship between actions and policy outcomes. If the action of A performed at time t^1 , then the results O will appear t^2 . Each hypothesis is based on experience and assumptions about cause and effect, so the hypothesis is nothing more than a guess until the hypothesis was tested by subsequent experience.

Monitoring of policies is important for the implementation of a policy. Monitoring is important because it provides information about the causes and effects of public policy (Dunn 2003). Monitoring policy has four functions in the view of policy analysts, namely:

1. Compliance. Monitoring is useful to determine, whether the action administrators, staff and other offenders are in accordance with the standards and procedures made by legislators and government,
2. Examination. Monitoring helps determine whether the resources and services aimed at target groups have been up to them,
3. Accounting. Monitoring generates information useful for accounting for socio-economic changes that occurred after a number of policies implemented within a certain time,
4. Explanatory. Monitoring can gather information that could explain why the results of public policies and programs can be different.

Street vendors is one of the focus of government policy in making the arrangement of Semarang city merchants who use public space. In a public policy perspective, the street vendors are in a position that should be served, while the city of Semarang and its apparatus of government is a party that was supposed to provide services through the measures taken. As said by Ndraha (2003), the government works to meet the needs of society as consumers of government products by doing public and civil service.

Government made a public service because government is a public agency that serves public interest, whereas in the case of civil service, government shall at all times ready to give service to any person in need. But in reality, the condition is on the contrary, people serve and the government is served. That is why government practice often lead to the abuse of power that creates corruption, collusion and nepotism.

As the party that controls the resources of political, economic, cultural, and military, the government is in a superordinate position, that is the very powerful party to regulate and control the community, including small traders as well as street vendors. In that position, the city government with all its policies must be adhered to and obeyed by street vendors. Regulation number 11 of 2000 on Regulation and Development of Street Vendors, is one manifestation of Semarang city government policies that must be obeyed by street vendors. Street vendor as the subordinate, should be ready to be set and controlled by the government. In the context of power relations, the concern is if the public policy pursued by the City Government is a trick plan (scheming), as written by Marlowe (in Parsons 2005) which creates or manipulate a story that makes sense in order to secure the objectives of the engineer.

Regulation number 11 of 2000 is more control than empower street vendors. It can be seen from the title of the local regulation, local regulation number 11 year 2000 on the Regulation and Development of Street Vendors. This regulation is different from the law number 3 of 2008 on the management of street vendors, issued by the city of Surakarta. Regional Regulation No. 3 of 2008 shows the Surakarta government is obliged to manage street vendors so they can prosper. This is in accordance with *konsiderans* Regulation No. 3 of 2008 as follows.

- "That the street vendors (PKL) is the informal trade sector which is the realization of people's right in business and need to be given the opportunity to fulfill their need. The presence of street vendors need to be managed, organized, and empowered in such a way that its presence provides added value or benefit to the economy and urban growth and the creation of a good and healthy environment".

The substance of the law number 3 of 2008 showed a partiality to the street vendors. This is shown by the article about the rights of street vendors and empowerment to street vendors. Article 8 of the regulation states that to run its business, the placement of street vendors license holder is entitled to: (1) get the protection, comfort, and security of doing business, (2) using a place of business in accordance with the permission of the placement.

Regional Regulation No. 3 of 2008 requires the mayor to give empowerment to street vendors. In accordance with the provisions of article 12 paragraph (1), the empowerment of street vendors in the form of: (a) guidance and counseling in business management, (b) business development through partnerships with other economic agents, (3) guidance for capital improvement, and (4) improved facilities and infrastructure for vendors.

A form of empowerment suits the rights owned by street vendors. The right to protection, comfort, and safety in the conduct of business as stipulated in article 12 paragraph (1), will be brought to optimal, while street vendors are also assisted in business management, business development, capital improvement and infrastructure improvement. Provisions of empowerment in Local Regulation on street vendors made by the city of Surakarta is not found in the Local Regulation on street vendors set by the city of Semarang.

Regulation number 11 of 2000 only set an article about the rights of street vendors, which is in section 6. The section states that the street vendors have every right to get the license service, the location of street vendors supplying land, and gain setting and coaching. Article has not touched the real issue Street Vendors, the comfort and safety in the attempt. Regulation number 11 of 2000 also does not provide for an obligation that must be done by empowering city governments.

4.2. Reality of Semarang City Government Policy Implementation

Although it is recognized that the informal sector has contributed to economic development, but the policy made by the government and its repressive apparatus tended to put the street vendors as a nuisance that must be removed. Although its great contribution in absorbing labor force surplus, informal sector up to now still remains a marginalized sector, unfairly treated, and often considered a "disease" in the economy (Samhadi 2006:33).

The data collected from various sources indicates that the negative view of local government is more crystallized than the positive perception of the informal sector, especially the street vendors. The attitude of neglecting, omission, even expulsion, demolition, eviction or other violent behavior appear more dominant than the attitudes of actions and empowerment coaching.

Based on the data from Urban Poverty Consortium, during the year 2001-2003, not less than 24.748 street vendors and street stalls are being evicted from where they earn a living (Samhadi 2006:33). Carts and stalls were destroyed. In the same period, a total of 550 street singers and 17.103 pedicab were raided or destroyed, so that 34,000 people lost their livelihoods. In fact, when the economic crisis hit Indonesia in 1997, the informal sector proved to show resilience and able to be a damper (buffer) turbulence in the labor market to accommodate the overflow of millions of urban workers formal layoff victims.

Post-crisis, the informal sector back into its function as the safety valve in the middle of the inability of the government and formal sector to provide employment. According to data from BPS –Central Statistic Agency- (2006), informal sector absorbs approximately 70% of the workforce, while the formal sector only 30%.

PKL is like grass in the flower pot, so it must be pulled up by the roots so as not to interfere with the growth of flowers. Right to life of street vendors should be removed. That is a thought that triggered Bandar Lampung City Government to beautify the city by sweeping street vendors, such as street vendors operating in Bambu Kuning, Pasir Guntung market and around Pangkal Pinang.

Bandar Lampung city government's treatment also occurs in Semarang. The cruelty of Civil Service Police as municipal officers of Semarang appear when they conduct raids on street vendors along Thamrin street, Kampung Kali region, MT. Haryono street, and Menteri Supeno street during the month of November 2009. The completely uniformed Civil Service Police dismantled shanties used to trade and raise a few carts of merchandise into the truck. This is the example of the implementation of Street Vendors management policy that do not show partiality to the marginalized communities.

In March 2010, hundreds of municipal officials Civil Service Police also did eviction to PKL in Sampangan (Suara Merdeka Saturday, March 13, 2010). Not in a long time, Street Vendors Basudewo also evicted (Suara Merdeka Metro editions Thursday, June 24, 2010; Kompas Semarang edition Saturday, June 26, 2010; Kompas Semarang edition Tuesday, June 29, 2010). Government action does not reflect the excellent service that has been heralded, but reflects the arrogance of power of government.

The era of regional autonomy should provide flexibility to local governments to make public policy and provide excellent service to the community to improve their welfare. But from the survey results of Gadjah Mada University in 2002, there are still many weaknesses of the implementation of regional autonomy. Weaknesses include:

- i. officers are less responsive in providing services,
- ii. less innovative, so that various services are often late,
- iii. less accesible, so the service can not be reached by the public,
- iv. lack of coordination, so that the service is often collide each other or even wait for each other,
- v. too bureaucratic, especially in terms of licensing,
- vi. less willing to hear complaints, suggestions, and aspirations,
- vii. inefficient, there are many irrelevant requirements imposed on the customer (Ridwan and Achmad Sodik Sudrajat 2009:85).

The implementation of regional autonomy in fact intended to bring decision-making process to the lowest social groups, taking into account the characteristics of local culture and environment, so that public policy is acceptable and productive in selecting the community's needs and sense of justice (Ridwan and Achmad Sodik Sudrajat 2009: 110-111).

Public policy in the form of regional regulation which governs the street vendors, municipal regulation, and public order issues, seems more power-nuanced, showing how powerful the elite local government is, and public policy are likely to be regulating, controlling, and even less friendly to the informal sector, especially the street vendors who conduct business in crowded centers.

Some research shows the indication mentioned above. In a research dissertation on the *Resistance and Accommodation: A Study of Power Relations among Street Vendors, Thugs, and officials in Depok West Java*, Siswono (2009) concluded that the city government's policy on street vendors is ambivalent, that is, on the one side of the street vendors are considered as "savior" because it provides jobs, make it easy for city residents to obtain goods at cheap prices, increase the attractiveness of the city, and make the city come alive, but on the other hand, Street Vendors is considered as a "disease" that made the city into a chaotic, dirty, and not beautiful place. Similarly, Handoyo's dissertation research (2012) about The Existence of Street Vendors, Study of Social Capital Contribution

to 4. Resistance of Street Vendors in Semarang showed that from 2005 to 2011 government of Semarang has conducted the eviction of street vendors and the most severe is the eviction of street vendors in Basudewo and Sampangan .

Demolition and eviction of street vendors comes down from the local regulations which do not favor the marginalized groups, such as street vendors. Some local regulation (Regulation), such as regulation of Sukabumi No. 2 of 2004 on Public Order, Regulation No. 3 of Bandung Year 2005 on the Implementation of Orderliness, Cleanliness, and Beauty, regulation of DKI Jakarta No. 8 of 2007 on Public Order, regulation Jembrana district No. 5 of 2007 on the Hygiene and Public Order, and the city of Semarang law number 11 year 2000 are not much different, which regulate, prohibit, and curb the street vendors in order not to trade or do business on the roadside or other place that cause disruption of public order .

Public order as the spirit of local regulation on street vendors set by the government, is understood as a regular order or circumstances in accordance with the norms prevailing in the society, in order to create a dynamic, safe, and quiet. But unfortunately, the public order is understood by the rulers as the activities of regulating, controlling, and discipline, even cracking. The smell of the law was *rechtmatig*-patterned or arrange for the orderly, not *doelmatig*-patterned or welfaring. Yet according to the principle of Syracuse, public order should be understood as a number of rules that ensure the proper functioning of society or a series of fundamental principles underlying the establishment of the community. Aspects of human rights at the heart of any laws, including regulations, does not seem to be touched in the sample of some regulations mentioned before.

Similarly, public policy in the form of regulations made by local governments, which intersect with the presence of street vendors, seems more to manage, control, discipline, and cracking down on street vendors, as if they were enemies of society and the state that must be purged from the earth.

Morrell, et al (2008:4) in his research view that the local regulation governing street vendors are unclear, contradictory, and punitive. Not surprisingly, the regulations made by local authorities tend not to be pro-poor which according to them, have no economic value. Modern economy relies on the formal sector they serve. Capitalism with the prestige of the abundance which they stand, rather than non-formal economic institution or informal sector. This is what causes the behavior of the ruler with hegemonic power through repressive apparatus fight against street vendors, who are economically and socially not advantageous for them. The unfair and arbitrary act of local government (county or city) gets opposition and resistance (resistance) from street vendors.

4.3. Neoliberal Policies, rather than Nationalism Policies

Neoliberalism is actually an application liberal values in the economy in a new form. The word "neo" in neoliberalism refers to the resurgence of the new form of old liberalism economy that was originally pioneered by British economist Adam Smith in his work, *The Wealth of Nations* (Fakih 2009). In contrast to the classical (liberal) who do not want government intervention, neoliberalism require government intervention within certain limit to generate economy. Government intervention in this case doesn't mean taking over market's role, but providing a range of facilities that allow markets to work without distortion. Judging from its origin, the neoliberal state should be more concerned with the rights of individual private property, rule of law and institutions of free markets and free trade (Harvey 2009:107).

As a new round of capitalism, neoliberal system requires the existence of the state, but in terms of (1) protecting the trade of the bourgeois based on civil law, (2) being a shield for the market mechanism of side effects such as self-destruction, such as the existence of laws on the protection of labor, (3) providing the conditions of production in the economy as a whole, such as education in public schools, public transport and communications, and adapting civil law systems to the needs arising from the accumulation process, such as taxation, banking and business law (Habermas 2004: 132). Fulfilling the three functions of this country can ensure that neoliberal and capitalist production process can run well.

Individualism as the essential values of liberalism, is the main characteristic of neoliberalism. Neoliberalism understands individualism as an act of selfishness (self-seeking) and act to maximize profits in the market (Giddens 2003:30). This is consistent with Smith's view that man is homo economicus who always pursues its own interests in order to obtain pleasure or benefit as much as possible of what is owned (Notonagoro 2011:12). Based on that way of thinking, neoliberal policies are government policies characterized by a number of characteristics, among which is the strict implementation of the budget (including the removal of subsidies), financial sector liberalization, trade liberalization, and privatization of SOEs (Notonagoro 2011:19). Tax reform, in the form of giving allowance for employers to pay taxes and foreign direct investment, that is, the policy to get rid of all the government regulations that inhibit the entry of foreign capital, is also part of the neoliberal policies.

Neoliberalism is not just about economic statistics, but a building of ideology about human and community settings. Neoliberalism is rooted in the Liberal Order that became the forerunner of social market economy in Germany. Liberal Order took place in the tension between individuality of freedom and sociality of order. In the history of the Liberal Order, neoliberalism emerged from the libertarian school of the main initiator of Milton Friedman, Friedrich von Hayek, Gary Becker and George Stigler. Neoliberalism believe that various human relations whether it is political, legal, cultural, psychological, aesthetic, and spiritual are guided by the principle of income transactions in the performance of a market economy (Priyono 2006:5). Referring to the view that human relations are market relations, neoliberalism put forward the idea of homo oeconomicus as a theory of human nature that is applied in the fields of politics, economy, law, psychology, history, psychology, human sciences and humanities (Priyono 2006:7). The most perfect incarnation of homo oeconomicus is business, ie employer. Model of the real man is a businessman, so everyone should see and modify itself according to the idiom of business and markets. This means anything that exists, such as money, land, beauty, and a diploma, in the logic of capital market, should be transformed into capital that can generate a profit or surplus. In short, the whole group of human relationship is a firm.

Privatization does not always have to be declared as neoliberalism. Although neoliberalism is not synonymous with privatization, but a wave of privatization in Indonesia in almost all aspects of life can be characterized as siding with the jargon of neoliberalism. In health sector, there is no service to the people, but a hospital business. None of the patients, but treatment consumers. In the field of education, no teachers but a lesson seller. In the area of land, no land service to the people, but the eviction of the people and land business. In the field of law, no legal services, but a legal business. The disease of neoliberal also affects the government officials. A state is understood as an enterprise and government officials referred to as entrepreneurs. That's why, it is not a mistake when local officials sell the city, offering the land and everything to the investors. Policy is considered correct and successful, if the policy can invite investors to share in education, health, agriculture, plantation, tourism, and other urban services.

Semarang city which from the beginning want to make itself as a center of trade and services, is inseparable from the snares of neoliberalism. Dominantly, Semarang city government policy indicates more on neoliberal policy rather than nationalism-based policy. This is evident in the research dissertation by Eko Handoyo (2012) which indicates that the establishment of many five-star hotel, such as Novotel, Horizon, Gumaya, Ibis, Wizz; apartment for the haves, like the Star Hotel, and the permissions granted to Indomart and Alfamart, is the evidence of neoliberal policy of Semarang city government which is more open to investors rather than small traders, including street vendors. The reality of pro-investment policy is supported by the Regional Long Term Development Plan (RPJPD) Semarang city in 2005-2025. In the years 2005-2025 RPJPD Semarang, Semarang city government supports the creation of government policies that pro-investment, by creating a conducive environment for investors in the country and abroad in all cases (Law No. 6 of 2010). In accordance with the policies of SETARA by the mayor of Semarang, in 2010 the government expects the asset management partnership with the investor of 75%.

The nationalisms of policies that should be understood as a policy in favor of the common people or the general public, was not done by the city of Semarang. If there is any pro-people policies, it was done merely as lip-service, only superficial, not substantial. Perhaps the government needs fresh funds to build the city of Semarang as SETARA city, which is equivalent to other metropolitan cities. It can not be done without holding investor. City with many luxury hotels, luxury apartments, entertainment centers, beautiful parks, perhaps become a dream of city leaders, so that investors or wealthy people are interested to invest their shares in the city of Semarang. With many investors come in, it is expected that the ideals to make Semarang equal with other metropolitan cities will be able to be realized.

In reality, government partiality to the people who are vulnerable economically and politically, such as street vendors is far more lower than its support to entrepreneurs who are considered well endowed. There are more government tendency to investors. Whereas the paradigm of nationalism states that a policy taken by government should give greater attention to the segments of society who are economically, politically, socially, and culturally vulnerable. Nationalism in the policy should be understood as a set policy based on the people, the interests of the people, and ultimately sided with those who do not have access to social, political, economic, and cultural resources.

5. Conclusion

Not all county and city governments do not have alignments to marginal groups, many city government have one, such as the city of Surakarta, Yogyakarta and several other counties. Yet, more local governments and municipalities are pro-investor. Economic policy set by local government is generally more oriented toward efforts to attract investors to build the city, so that the ideal city to be a center of trade and services can be realized. The city government of Semarang is one of the few local governments whose policies tend to give priority to existence of investor rather than the presence of small traders, including street vendors.

The rise of five-star hotel, the establishment of apartments, many Indomart and Alfamart that mushroomed in almost all districts in Semarang is evidence of Semarang city government partiality to investor or entrepreneur. Semarang city spatial planning and Law No. 11 of 2000 on Street Vendors development is a source of government policies that provide opportunities to investors to run business in Semarang. Street Vendors, especially wild Street Vendors do not have a great opportunity to carry out economic activities. This is caused by the law No. 11 of 2000 which did not allow them to develop properly. In addition, the city government did not provide social security, economic, and legal support to street vendors, such as insurance, appropriate space, credit, marketing, legal protection, and others.

The evaluation of the law No. 11 of 2000 and the implementation of local regulation as executed by the apparatus of government, such as Civil Service Police and Market Board shows that the policy of Semarang city is characterized by neo-liberalism. It can be seen from the regulation of social and economic relations between the government and society (businessmen, street vendors, and others) that is controlled by market relations. Transactional policy, that is a policy based on the principle of gains and losses was taken by the city of Semarang. Consequently, street vendors are marginalized, when it should be marginal groups, who do not have access and assets that should be a government priority. Nationalism of policy that should be pointed out by the government does not appear, because the alignments to marginal or poor communities is almost non-existent. If there is, it is just lip-service.

6. Acknowledgement

I would like to thanks for Semarang State University and Ministry of Higher Education for their financial support.

7. References

- i. Anderson, James E. (2000). Public Policymaking Fourth Edition. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- ii. Bhowmik, Sharit K. (2005). "Street Vendor in Asia : a Review". in Economic and Political Weekly May 28-June 4, 2005.pp.2256-2264.

- iii. Castells, Manuel and Alejandro Portes. (1989). "World Underneath: The Origins, Dynamics, and Effects of the Informal Economy". in Alejandro Portes, Manuel Castells, and Laurel A. Benton (eds). *The Informal Economy Studies in Advanced and Less Developed Countries*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- iv. Chen, Martha, et al. (2005). *Progress of The World's Women 2005 Women Work and Poverty*. UNIFEM.
- v. Creswell, John W. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design Choosing Among Five Approach Second Edition*. London : SAGE Publications.
- vi. Davis, Justine. (2008). "Selling Wares on The Streets of Accra: A Case Study of Street Hawkers in Ghana's Capital". in *FOCUS on Geography Winter 2008 Volume 51, Number 3*, pp. 32-36.
- vii. Dunn, William N. (2003). *Understanding Public Policy Tenth Edition*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- viii. Fakhri, Mansour. (2009). *Runtuhnya Teori Pembangunan dan Globalisasi*. Yogyakarta: INSIST PRESS dan Pustaka Pelajar.
- ix. Friedman, Jonathan, ed., (2003) *Globalization, the State and Violence*. Walnut Creek, CA: Alta Mira Press.
- x. Giddens, Anthony. (2003). *Beyond Left and Right (Tarian Ideologi Alternatif di atas Pusara Sosialisme dan Kapitalisme)*. terjemahan Imam Khoiri. Yogyakarta: IRCISoD.
- xi. Gillham, Bill. (2000). *Case Study Research Methods*. London: Paston PrePress.
- xii. Greenfield, G., (2004) "Free Market Freefall: Declining Agricultural Commodity Prices and the Market Access Myth" FGS Unpublished.
- xiii. Grindle, Merilee S. (1980). *Politics and Policy Implementation in The Third World*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- xiv. Habermas, Jurgen. (2004). *Krisis Legitimasi*. terjemahan Yudi Santoso. Yogyakarta: Kalam.
- xv. Handoyo, Eko. (2012). *Eksistensi Pedagang Kaki Lima Studi tentang Kontribusi Modal Sosial terhadap Resistensi PKL di Semarang*. Disertasi Program Doktor Studi Pembangunan PPS UKSW Salatiga. Tidak diterbitkan.
- xvi. Harvey, David. (2009). *Neoliberalisme dan Restorasi Kelas Kapitalis*. Terjemahan Eko Prasetyo Darmawan. Yogyakarta: Resist Book.
- xvii. Harvey, David. (2010). *Imperialisme Baru Genealogi dan Logika Kapitalisme Kontemporer*. Terjemahan Eko PD. Yogyakarta: Resist Book dan Institut for Global Justice.
- xviii. Henley, et al.(2006). *On Defining and Measurement the Informal Sector*. World Bank PolicyResearch Working Paper 3866. Washington DC : World Bank.
- xix. Jones, Charles O. (1991). *Pengantar Kebijakan Publik*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- xx. Kompas Edisi Semarang, Sabtu, 26 Juni 2010, Halaman C.
- xxi. Kompas Edisi Semarang, Selasa, 29 Juni 2010, Halaman C.
- xxii. Morrell, Elizabeth, dkk. (2008). *Tata Kelola Ekonomi Informal Policy Brief 11*. Australia : Crawford School of Economics and Government the Australian National University.
- xxiii. Mubyarto. (1988). *Sistem dan Moral Ekonomi Indonesia*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- xxiv. Mubyarto. (2004). *Ekonomi Pancasila Evaluasi Dua Tahun Pustep-UGM*. Yogyakarta: Aditya Media dan Pustep UGM.
- xxv. Nasution, S. (1988). *Metode Penelitian Naturalistik Kualitatif*. Bandung: Tarsito.
- xxvi. Nawawi, Ismail. (2009). *Public Policy Analisis, Strategi Advokasi Teori dan Praktik*. Surabaya: PMN.
- xxvii. Ndraha. (2003). *Kybernology (Ilmu Pemerintahan Baru) 2*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- xxviii. Neuman, W. Lawrence. (2003). *Social Research Methods Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches Fifth Edition*. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
- xxix. Noer Effendi, Tadjuddin., (2005). "Pengangguran Terbuka dan Setengah Pengangguran di Indonesia Mengapa Tidak Meledak Saat Krisis Ekonomi". Speech on Inagural Professorship March 5, 2005 Gadjah Mada University-Yogyakarta.
- xxx. Notonagoro, Wisnu HKP. (2011). *Neoliberalisme Mencengkeram Indonesia IMF, World Bank, WTO Sumber Bencana Ekonomi Bangsa*. Jakarta: Sekretariat Jenderal Gerakan Kebangsaan Rakyat Semesta.
- xxxi. Nugroho, Riant. (2009). *Public Policy*. Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo.
- xxxii. OECD. (2002). *Measuring The Non-Observed Economy A Handbook*. Paris : OECD Publications Service.
- xxxiii. Ozveren, Eyup. (2005). "Polanyi, Chayanov, and Lessons for the Study of the Informal Sector". in *Journal of Economic Issues Vol. XXXIX No. 3 September 2005 pp. 765-775*.
- xxxiv. Parsons, Wayne. (2005). *Public Policy Pengantar Teori dan Praktik Analisis Kebijakan*. Terjemahan Tri Wibowo Budi Santoso. Jakarta: Prenada Media.
- xxxv. Permadi, Gilang. (2007). *Pedagang Kaki Lima Riwayatmu Dahulu, Nasibmu Kini!* Jakarta: Yudhistira.
- xxxvi. Prasetyantoko, A. (2009). *Krisis Finansial dalam Perangkap Ekonomi Neoliberal*. Jakarta: Kompas.
- xxxvii. Pribadi, Airlangga. (2008). "Ideologi Neoliberalisme dan Diskursus Demokrasi di Indonesia", makalah disampaikan dalam Konferensi Warisan Otoritarianisme: Demokrasi Tirani Modal di Kmpus UI Depok, 5-7 Agustus 2008. Diselenggarakan oleh ELSAM, FISIP UI, Reform Institute, JKB, Puskapol FISIP UI, Praxis, TURC, Pusdep, dan INFID.
- xxxviii. Priyono, B. Henry. (2006). "Neoliberalisme dan Sifat Elusif Kebebasan". Bahan Refleksi yang disampaikan dalam acara Pidato Kebudayaan selenggaraan Dewan Kesenian Jakarta di Taman Ismail Marzuki Jakarta tanggal 10 November 2006.
- xxxix. Reardon, Thomas and Rose Hopskin., 2006. *The Supermarket Revolution in Developing Countries: Policies to Address Emerging Tensions among Supermarket, Suppliers, and Tradisional Retailers*. in *European Journal of Development Research Vol. 18 No. 4*.
- xl. Ridwan, Juniarto dan Achmad Sodik Sudrajat., 2009. *Hukum Administrasi Negara dan Kebijakan Pelayanan Publik*. Bandung: Nuansa.

-
- xli. Robinson, Joan., 1972. "The Second Crisis of Economic Theory." *American Economic Review* 62, no. 1/2 (March): 1-10.
- xlii. Samhadi, Sri Hartati. (2006). "Dilema Sektor Informal". dalam *Harian Kompas Edisi Fokus*, Sabtu, 15 April 2006.
- xliii. Siswono, Eko. (2009). *Resistensi dan Akomodasi: Suatu Kajian tentang Hubungan-hubungan Kekuasaan pada Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL), Preman dan Aparat di Depok Jawa Barat*. Disertasi Program Pascasarjana Departemen Antropologi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik Universitas Indonesia. Jakarta. Tidak diterbitkan.
- xliv. Suryadarma, Daniel. (2007). *Dampak Supermarket terhadap Pasar dan Pedagang Ritel Tradisional di Daerah Perkotaan Indonesia*. Jakarta: SMERU.
- xlv. Swasono, Sri Edi. (2010). *Ekspose Ekonomika Mewaspadai Globalisasi dan Pasar Bebas*. Yogyakarta: Pustep UGM.
- xlvi. Swasono, Sri Edi. (2012). "Korupsi adalah Pengkhianatan terhadap Nasionalisme: Pengembangan Karakter dan Nasionalisme antara Das Sollen dan Das Sein". Makalah disajikan dalam Seminar dan Lokakarya Nasional Penguatan Karakter Pancasila dalam Pemberantasan Korupsi di Indonesia, diselenggarakan P3KB FIS Unnes Semarang, 3 Mei 2012.
- xlvii. *Suara Merdeka* Sabtu 13 Maret 2010.
- xlviii. *Suara Merdeka Edisi Semarang Metro* Kamis 24 Juni 2010.
- xlix. Winarno, Budi. (2007). *Kebijakan Publik Teori & Proses*. Yogyakarta: Media Pressindo.
1. (2010). *Melawan Gurita Neoliberalisme*. Jakarta: Erlangga.

Middle-low Income and Nationalism View from Street Vendors as Informal Workers

ORIGINALITY REPORT

6%

SIMILARITY INDEX

4%

INTERNET SOURCES

2%

PUBLICATIONS

3%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	Submitted to CVC Nigeria Consortium Student Paper	1%
2	hdl.handle.net Internet Source	1%
3	edoc.site Internet Source	<1%
4	moam.info Internet Source	<1%
5	www.wiego.org Internet Source	<1%
6	es.scribd.com Internet Source	<1%
7	Submitted to Universitas 17 Agustus 1945 Surabaya Student Paper	<1%
8	www.ijrte.org Internet Source	<1%

9	www.annd.org Internet Source	<1%
10	Submitted to University of Bradford Student Paper	<1%
11	www.i-scholar.in Internet Source	<1%
12	Wardah Yuspin, Absori ., Nunik Nurhayati. "THE ESTABLISHMENT OF PARTICIPATORY REGIONAL REGULATIONS BASED ON LOCAL WISDOM", Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews, 2019 Publication	<1%
13	journal.unnes.ac.id Internet Source	<1%
14	Submitted to Universitas Teuku Umar Student Paper	<1%
15	www.atlantis-press.com Internet Source	<1%
16	led.co.za Internet Source	<1%
17	C Sugyati, D Mariana, D F Sjoraida. "The position of the targets of the public health policy of maternal and child in Bandung", IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science, 2018	<1%

18

Submitted to University of Sheffield

Student Paper

<1%

19

repository.unhas.ac.id

Internet Source

<1%

20

gardapapua.blogspot.com

Internet Source

<1%

21

Kismartini, , and Muh Yusuf. "Stakeholders Analysis: Managing Coastal Policy Implementation in Rembang District", *Procedia Environmental Sciences*, 2015.

Publication

<1%

22

biblioteca-alternativa.noblogs.org

Internet Source

<1%

23

islamicmarkets.com

Internet Source

<1%

24

Roksana Bahramitash. "Gender and Entrepreneurship in Iran", *Springer Science and Business Media LLC*, 2013

Publication

<1%

25

Justine Davis. "Selling Wares on the Streets of Accra: A Case Study of Street Hawkers in Ghana's Capital", *Focus on Geography*, 12/2008

Publication

<1%

26

docs.wixstatic.com

Internet Source

<1%

27

www.afristat.org

Internet Source

<1%

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography On